TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface ...........................................................................................................</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface to Second Edition .............................................................................</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases .................................................................................................</td>
<td>TC-1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PART I. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................. 1-1

CHAPTER 2. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW ..................................................................... 2-1

I. Constitutional Remedies at Confederation ............................................ 2-1

II. Interplay of Judicial and Legislative Remedies: The Manitoba Language and Schools Crises ........................................................... 2-6

   A. Minority Language Rights ................................................................ 2-7
   B. Denominational School Rights .................................................. 2-10
   C. Summary .................................................................................... 2-13

III. Civil Disobedience ................................................................................... 2-14

IV. The Development of Judicial Remedies ............................................... 2-15

   A. Damages .................................................................................... 2-15
   B. Injunctions .............................................................................. 2-17
   C. Declarations ........................................................................... 2-18
   D. Standing .................................................................................. 2-20
   E. Prerogative Writs .................................................................... 2-21

V. Remedies in the Criminal Process .......................................................... 2-22

   A. Exclusion of Improperly Obtained Evidence .................................. 2-22
   B. Stays of Proceedings ................................................................ 2-23
   C. Habeas Corpus .......................................................................... 2-25

VI. The Canadian Bill of Rights .................................................................... 2-26

VII. The Development of Administrative Remedies ..................................... 2-29

   A. Human Rights Commissions ..................................................... 2-29
   B. Social and Economic Rights .................................................. 2-31

VIII. International Law ..................................................................................... 2-32

IX. The Development of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms ............ 2-34

X. Conclusion ............................................................................................... 2-37
CHAPTER 3. REMEDIAL PURPOSES, PRINCIPLES AND CONSTRAINTS .............................................. 3-1

I. Textual Approaches ......................................................................................... 3-4
A. Section 24(1) of the Charter ................................................................. 3-5
B. Section 24(2) of the Charter ................................................................. 3-6
C. Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982 ........................................ 3-8
II. Positive and Negative Remedies .................................................................. 3-10
III. The Nature of Remedial Discretion ............................................................ 3-13
IV. Purposive Approaches ................................................................................. 3-15
V. Meaningful Remedies that Compensate and Vindicate ......................... 3-19
VI. Effective Remedies that Ensure Compliance in the Future ...................... 3-24
VII. Respecting Institutional Roles ................................................................. 3-31
VIII. Fairness to all the Parties ......................................................................... 3-37
IX. Countervailing Factors and Interests that Mitigate Remedies ................. 3-39
X. Retroactive and Prospective Relief ............................................................ 3-43
XI. The Roles of Proportionality as a Remedial Principle ............................. 3-46
   A. Proportionality and the Choice of Less Drastic or Intrusive Remedies ... 3-47
   B. Proportionality and the Justification of Public Interest Constraints on Remedies 3-50
XII. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 3-55

PART II. ACCESS TO CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES

CHAPTER 4. INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 4-1

CHAPTER 5. STANDING AND TIMING ......................................................... 5-1

I. Standing Under Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982 ....................... 5-2
   A. Discretionary Standing for Those Not Directly Affected by Impugned Laws or Activities .... 5-3
      (1) Serious issue of constitutionality ..................................................... 5-5
      (2) Genuine interest in the validity of the legislation ............................. 5-7
      (3) A reasonable and effective way to bring the issue to court .......... 5-8
      (4) Summary ..................................................................................... 5-13
   B. Standing as of Right for Those Directly Affected ................................. 5-13
   C. Standing of the Accused to Challenge Unconstitutional Laws ................ 5-17
II. Standing Under Section 24(1) of the Charter ........................................... 5-19
III. Establishing the Basis for Claiming a Charter Remedy ...... 5-26  
A. The Need for Facts to Support Violations and Remedies ...................................................................... 5-26  
B. Burdens of Proof ..................................................................................................................... 5-27  
C. Standard of Appellate Review ................................................................................................. 5-28.1  
IV. Ripeness and Claims in Anticipation of a Violation ........... 5-28.2  
V. Mootness and Claims After a Dispute is Resolved............. 5-32  
A. Adversarial Presentation ......................................................................................................... 5-36  
B. Judicial Economy ..................................................................................................................... 5-37  
C. Relations with Other Institutions .......................................................................................... 5-38  
D. Immunizing Actions from Review .......................................................................................... 5-39  
E. A Reasonable and Effective Way to Bring the Issue to Court .................................................. 5-42  
VI. Conclusion ............................................................................................................................. 5-43

CHAPTER 6. COURT OF COMPETENT JURISDICTION...... 6-1  
I. General Definitions of a Court of Competent Jurisdiction... 6-3  
A. Jurisdiction under Section 24(1) of the Charter .......... 6-3  
B. Jurisdiction under Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982 ................................................. 6-10.1  
II. Jurisdiction in the Criminal Process.................................. 6-18  
A. Preliminary Inquiries ................................................ 6-18  
B. Superior Courts ......................................................................................................................... 6-20  
C. Trial Courts ................................................................................................................................ 6-23  
   (1) Provinicial and other statutory courts ................. 6-23  
   (2) Superior courts .................................................. 6-26  
D. Appellate Courts ....................................................... 6-27  
E. Federal Court ........................................................... 6-28  
III. Jurisdiction in the Civil Process ....................................... 6-30  
A. Role of Provincial Superior Courts............................. 6-30  
   (1) In Relation to the Federal Court ...................... 6-30  
   (2) In Relation to Administrative Agencies and Schemes ......................................................... 6-32  
IV. Jurisdiction in the Administrative Process ......................... 6-34  
A. Jurisdiction under Section 52(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982 ................................................ 6-35  
B. Jurisdiction under Section 24(1) of the Charter .......... 6-38  
C. The Role of Provincial Superior Courts and the Federal Court ................................................ 6-41  
V. Conclusion ............................................................................................................................. 6-42
CHAPTER 7. INTERLOCUTORY REMEDIES

I. Interlocutory Injunctions
   A. Standard of Review
   A.1 Strength of the Plaintiff’s Case
      (1) Serious Question that is not Frivolous or Vexatious
      (2) Simple Questions of Law
      (3) Final determination of an Action
      (4) No Presumption of Constitutionality
   B. Irreparable Harm
      (1) Irreparable Harm to the Plaintiff
      (2) Irreparable Harm to the Defendant
      (3) Plaintiff’s Undertaking to Pay Damages
   C. Balance of Convenience
      (1) Maintenance of the Status Quo
      (2) Consideration of the Public Interest
      (3) Suspensions and Exemptions
      (4) The Balance of Convenience and Proportionality
      (5) Balance of Convenience and Injunctions that both Threaten and Protect Constitutional Rights

II. Interim Stays of Proceedings Based on Legislation Alleged to be Unconstitutional

III. Interim Declarations

IV. Interim Costs

V. Review of the Trial Judge’s Decision

VI. Conclusion

PART III. CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES

CHAPTER 8. INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 9. REMEDIES IN THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

I. The Evolution and Purposes of Remedies in the Criminal Process

II. Stays of Proceedings
   A. The Test for Granting a Stay of Proceedings
      (1) The Alternative grounds of Protecting Rights and Judicial Integrity
      a) The Differences and Relation Between the Alternative Grounds
      b) Stays based on Judicial Integrity
      c) Stays based on Fair Trial Grounds
TABLE OF CONTENTS

d) The Cumulative Effects of Harms to Rights and Judicial Integrity ......................... 9-14

(2) The Need for the Abuse to be Perpetuated by the Subsequent Trial ................. 9-16

(3) No Other Less Drastic but Adequate Alternative Remedies ......................... 9-19

(4) Balancing the Affected Interests ......... 9-21

(5) Procedural Matters ......................... 9-23

(a) Burdens and Standards of Proof ... 9-23

(b) Procedure and Timing of Stay Applications ... 9-24

(c) Appellate Deference to Trial Judges’ Decisions ......................... 9-24

(d) Summary ......................... 9-26

B. Stays and Alternative Remedies for Violation of Disclosure Rights ....................... 9-26

(1) Cases where Stays of Proceedings have been Granted and Upheld ..................... 9-27

(2) Cases where Stays of Proceedings have been Reversed ......................... 9-30

(3) Alternative Remedies for Disclosure Violations ......................... 9-31

(a) Disclosure Orders ......................... 9-33

(b) Mistrials ......................... 9-33

(c) Exclusion of Evidence not Disclosed ......................... 9-34

(d) Costs ......................... 9-38

(e) New Trials ......................... 9-39

(f) Summary ......................... 9-40

C. Violation of Rights to Legal Assistance .............. 9-40

(1) Stays of Proceedings ......................... 9-40

(2) Alternative Remedies to Stays of Proceedings ........ 9-42

D. Violation of Rights Relating to Conditions of Confinement ......................... 9-42.1

E. Violation of Right to an Interpreter ......................... 9-42.2

F. Violations of Section 11(d) of the Charter ......................... 9-42.3

G. Violations of Section 11(b) of the Charter ......................... 9-43

(a) Delayed Child Apprehension Proceedings ......................... 9-49

H. Violations of Sections 8 and 9 of the Charter ......................... 9-50

I. Summary ......................... 9-57

III. Prerogative Remedies and Related Pre-Trial Relief ......................... 9-57

A. Non-Prerogative Pre-Trial Relief ......................... 9-58

B. Prerogative Relief ......................... 9-60.1

(1) Prohibition ......................... 9-61

(2) Mandamus ......................... 9-63

(3) Certiorari ......................... 9-63

IV. Return of Evidence ......................... 9-65
CONSTITUTIONAL REMEDIES IN CANADA

A. Court of Competent Jurisdiction................................. 9-66
B. Tests for Return of the Evidence................................ 9-66
V. Charter Violations as a Criminal Defence ................. 9-70
VI. Sentence Reductions.................................................. 9-70
   A. General Considerations ........................................... 9-70
   B. The Connection Between the Charter Violation
      and the Circumstances of the Offence ..................... 9-75
   C. Sentence Reductions and Statutory Minimums .......... 9-79
   D. Summary ............................................................ 9-81
VII. Relief Related to Conditions of Imprisonment .......... 9-81
VIII. Habeas Corpus and Related Relief......................... 9-83
   A. Section 10(c) of the Charter .................................. 9-83
   B. Expanded Grounds of Review.................................. 9-84
   C. Ancillary Remedies................................................ 9-90
IX. Conclusion .................................................................. 9-92

CHAPTER 10. EXCLUSION OF UNCONSTITUTIONALLY
          OBTAINED EVIDENCE................................ 10-1
I. The Evolution and Purposes of Exclusion of Evidence...... 10-1
   A. Exclusion of Evidence to Correct a Violation .......... 10-2
   B. Exclusion of Evidence to Regulate Police Conduct...... 10-3
   C. Balancing Tests for the Exclusion of Evidence........ 10-5
II. An Outline of Section 24(2) Jurisprudence................ 10-7
      (1) Exclusion to Prevent Unfair Trials.................... 10-9
      (2) Exclusion to Prevent Judicial Condonation of
            Unacceptable Conduct ................................... 10-10
      (3) The Effects of Excluding Evidence................... 10-11
      (4) Implications of the Collins tests....................... 10-12
      (5) Criticisms of the Collins tests......................... 10-14
   B. Abolition of the Fair Trial Test and the New Test
      in Grant .................................................................. 10-16
III. Threshold Issues in the Exclusion of Evidence .......... 10-20
   A. Standing ............................................................... 10-20
   B. Procedure for Exclusionary Claims ....................... 10-26
      (1) At Trial ............................................................. 10-26
      (2) On Appeal ........................................................ 10-28
      (3) Standard of Appellate Review ............................ 10-28
      (4) No Substantial Wrong or Miscarriage of Justice... 10-31
      (5) The Use that is Sought to be Made of the
            Impugned Evidence........................................... 10-31
   C. Burden of Proof........................................................ 10-33
      (1) Persuasive Burden .............................................. 10-33

C-6
(2) Evidential Burdens ............................................. 10-34
D. Evidence Obtained in a Manner that Violates Charter Rights ................................................................. 10-34
   (1) The Need for a Temporal or Causal Connection between the Violation and the Evidence .................. 10-34
      (a) Determining if the Connection between the Charter Violation and the Evidence Sought to be Excluded is too Remote ....................... 10-38
E. Conclusion to Threshold Issues .................................. 10-42.1
IV. The Three-Part Grant Test for Exclusion of Evidence ........ 10-43
   A. The Seriousness of the Charter Violation .................... 10-44
      (1) The Purpose of the Serious Violation Test ............ 10-45
      (2) Compliance with the Charter during the Investigation ................................................................. 10-46
      (3) Good Faith Violations .................................................. 10-48
          (a) Reliance on Statutes ..................................... 10-48
          (b) Reliance on Judicial Decisions ...................... 10-50
          (c) Reliance on Warrants ................................... 10-51
          (d) Reliance on Practices and Policies................. 10-56
          (e) The Effect of Uncertainty in the Law ............ 10-57
      Summary .................................................................. 10-58.1
      (4) Inadvertent and Minor Charter Violations............. 10-59
      (5) Deliberate, Blatant and Flagrant Violations........... 10-61
      (6) Availability of other Investigative Means and the Discoverability of the Evidence ..................... 10-63
      (7) Urgency and Necessity ....................................... 10-66
   B. The Impact of the Breach on the Accused’s Charter-Based Interests ......................................................... 10-69
      (1) Statements from the Accused .............................. 10-69
      (2) Bodily Substances .............................................. 10-71
      (3) Physical Evidence .............................................. 10-72
      (4) Derivative Evidence ........................................... 10-72.1
   C. Society’s Interest in an Adjudication on the Merits .... 10-72
      (1) Determining Disrepute ........................................ 10-73
      (2) The Seriousness of the Offence Charged .............. 10-74
      (3) The Importance and Reliability of the Evidence Sought to be Excluded ........................................ 10-77
V. Conclusion .................................................................. 10-81
CHAPTER 11. DAMAGES AND COSTS .............................. 11-1
I. The Evolution and Purposes of Money Awards ............. 11-4
II. Procedural Barriers to Charter Damage Claims .......... 11-6
   A. Court of Competent Jurisdiction ............................... 11-6
      (1) Provincial Criminal Courts ................................ 11-7
A. Superior Courts of Criminal Jurisdiction .............. 11-9

B. Class Proceedings ..................................................... 11-12

C. Estoppel and Abuse of Process .................................. 11-13

D. Statutes of Limitation................................................ 11-14

D. Immunities from Civil Actions .................................. 11-16

  (1) Absolute Immunities........................................... 11-16

  (2) Qualified Immunities .......................................... 11-21

III. Elements of a Charter Damage Claim............................... 11-24

A. The Appropriate Defendant ....................................... 11-26

B. The Functional Need for Damages ............................. 11-28

  (1) Compensation for a Wide Range of Harm
      and Loss..................................................................... 11-29

  (2) Vindication of the Charter Right.......................... 11-30

  (3) Deterrence of Future Charter Violations ............... 11-31

C. Countervailing Factors to the Award of Damages........ 11-32

  (1) Alternative Remedies.......................................... 11-32

  (2) Effective Governance Concerns ........................... 11-33

D. Appropriate and Just Quantums of Damage Awards... 11-34.6

  (1) Rejection of Per Se Awards ................................ 11-34.6

  (2) Compensatory Awards ........................................ 11-34.7

  (3) Vindication ........................................................ 11-34.13

  (4) Deterrence ......................................................... 11-34.13

  (5) Exemplary and Punitive Damages........................ 11-34.15

IV. Costs.............................................................................. 11-36

A. Advance Costs ......................................................... 11-36

B. The Application of Costs Rule in Constitutional
   Litigation................................................................. 11-40

  (1) Costs in Criminal Cases and Appeals................... 11-40

  (2) Costs against an Unsuccessful Charter Applicant .. 11-42

  (3) Costs for an Unsuccessful Charter Applicant ...... 11-47

  (4) Costs for a Successful Charter Applicant......... 11-48

C. The Use of Costs as a Section 24(1) Remedy .......... 11-52

V. Conclusion ..................................................................... 11-56

CHAPTER 12. DECLARATIONS.......................................... 12-1

I. The Evolution and Purposes of Declaratory Relief......... 12-3

II. Declarations Concerning Future Violations................ 12-6

III. Declarations Concerning Past Violations .................... 12-14

IV. Declarations Concerning Constitutional Rights .......... 12-23

A. Minority Language Cases ........................................ 12-24

B. Equality Cases......................................................... 12-29

C. Suspended Declarations............................................ 12-32

D. Summary ................................................................. 12-32.1
TABLE OF CONTENTS

V. “Declarations Plus” ................................................................. 12-33
   A. Declarations, Retention of Jurisdiction and Other
      Means to Resolve Disputes about the Declaration ...... 12-34
   B. Declarations that are Directions ................................. 12-36.2
   C. Consultation and Negotiations about the Implementation
      of Declarations ............................................................. 12-38
   D. Declarations on Consent ............................................. 12-41
VI. When Declarations may not be Appropriate and Just .......... 12-44
   A. Custodial Institutions ................................................ 12-46
   B. Governmental Resistance and Neglect ....................... 12-49
VII. Conclusion ......................................................................... 12-51

CHAPTER 13. INJUNCTIONS AND OTHER MANDATORY
          REMEDIES ................................................................. 13-1

I. The Evolution and Purposes of Mandatory Relief .......... 13-2
   A. The Role of Equity ................................................. 13-3
   B. Crown Immunity and the Preference for Declaratory
      Relief ........................................................................ 13-5

II. Comparative Experience With Injunctions as a
      Constitutional Remedy ................................................. 13-6
   A. The United States .................................................... 13-6
      (1) Judicial Experience .............................................. 13-7
      (2) Fiss’s typology .................................................... 13-9
      (3) Other perspectives .............................................. 13-11
   B. India ......................................................................... 13-13
   C. South Africa ............................................................ 13-16

III. The Use of Injunctions in Canada ..................................... 13-20
   A. Preventive Injunctions .............................................. 13-20
   B. Reparative Injunctions .............................................. 13-22
      (1) Reference re: Language Rights under the Manitoba
      Act, 1870 .................................................................... 13-22
   C. Structural Injunctions ................................................. 13-27
      (1) Cases where Structural Injunctions have been
      Granted and Sustained on Appeal .............................. 13-29
         (a) La Société des Acadiens v. Minority Language
            School Board ...................................................... 13-29
         (b) Marchand v. Simcoe (County) Board of
            Education ............................................................ 13-31
         (c) Lavoie v. Nova Scotia ....................................... 13-34
         (d) Doucet-Boudreau v. Nova Scotia ....................... 13-38
         (e) Other Minority Language Rights Cases.............. 13-44
         (f) National Security Cases .................................... 13-47
(2) Cases where Structural Injunctions were Not Ordered or Overturned on Appeal ........................................ 13-48.1
(a) Little Sisters Book and Art Emporium v. Canada (Minister of Justice) ......................... 13-48
(b) Khadr and Diplomatic Representations .......... 13-52
(c) Thibodeau v. Air Canada.............................. 13-61
(d) Other Cases................................................. 13-66

IV. Other Mandatory Remedies.............................................. 13-66.1
A. Mandamus ............................................................... 13-66.1
(1) Voting Rights Cases ........................................... 13-66.1
(2) The Insite Decision ............................................ 13-70
B. Prohibition ............................................................... 13-72

V. Mandatory Remedies to Enforce Equality Rights.......... 13-73
A. American Experience................................................ 13-74
B. Canadian Experience Under Human Rights Codes...... 13-75
   (1) Remedies Available under Human Rights Codes...
   (2) The Approach to Remedies under Human Rights Codes................................................. 13-77
   (3) Action Travail des Femmes v. C.N.R. Co............. 13-80

VI. Conclusion ..................................................................... 13-84

CHAPTER 14. REMEDIES INVOLVING LEGISLATION...... 14-1

I. The Evolution and Purposes of Remedies for Unconstitutional Legislation................................. 14-3
A. American Experience................................................ 14-3
B. Canadian Experience................................................. 14-8
   (1) Enforcing the Division of Powers...................... 14-8
   (2) The Evolution of Section 52(1) Charter Remedies............................................................ 14-10

II. Upholding Permissive Legislation................................. 14-13

III. Reading Down Potentially Unconstitutional Legislation..... 14-15
A. Freedom of Expression Cases................................. 14-16
   (1) Osborne and Rocket ........................................... 14-16
   (2) Butler, Zundel and Sharpe................................... 14-18
   (3) Criminal cases ................................................... 14-25
      (a) Cases Where Reading In was Not Appropriate 14-29
      (b) Radical Reading In to Save s. 43 of the Criminal Code .............................................. 14-30
   (4) Administrative Cases ........................................ 14-30.3
   (5) Summary ......................................................... 14-34.1

IV. Constitutional Exemptions.............................................. 14-34.2
A. Early cases............................................................. 14-36
B. Ferguson ............................................................... 14-38
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C. Constitutional Exemptions After Ferguson</td>
<td>14-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Section 24(1) Remedies</td>
<td>14-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Section 24(1) Exemptions During a Suspended Declaration of Invalidity</td>
<td>14-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Reading Down as a Functional Alternative</td>
<td>14-46.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Severance</td>
<td>14-47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Cases where Severance is Not Appropriate</td>
<td>14-48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Cases where Severance is Appropriate</td>
<td>14-51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Summary</td>
<td>14-52.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Extension by Reading In or Nullification of Underinclusive Legislation</td>
<td>14-52.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Extension of Legislation through Invalidation or Reading In</td>
<td>14-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Schachter v. Canada</td>
<td>14-54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Respect for the Role of the Legislature</td>
<td>14-57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Remedial Precision</td>
<td>14-57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Consistency with Legislative Objectives</td>
<td>14-58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) The Size of the Group to be Included</td>
<td>14-58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Respect for the Purposes of the Charter</td>
<td>14-58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The Protection of Vulnerable Minorities</td>
<td>14-58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The Role of Constitutional Rights and Hints</td>
<td>14-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Temporary Suspensions of Nullification or Extension</td>
<td>14-61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Summary</td>
<td>14-63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Cases where Extension by Reading In is Appropriate</td>
<td>14-63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Cases where Extension by Reading In was Not Appropriate</td>
<td>14-68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Summary</td>
<td>14-73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Suspended Declaration of Invalidity</td>
<td>14-73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reference re: Language Rights and Other Bilingualism Cases</td>
<td>14-74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. R. v. Swain and Other Early Cases</td>
<td>14-77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Schachter v. Canada</td>
<td>14-79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Cases where Suspended Declarations of Invalidity are Appropriate</td>
<td>14-82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Cases that Fall Within the Schachter Guidelines</td>
<td>14-82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Cases Outside the Schachter Guidelines</td>
<td>14-83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Exempting Successful Charter Applicants from the Period of Suspension</td>
<td>14-87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Cases where Applicants were Exempted</td>
<td>14-88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Cases where Applicants were not Exempted</td>
<td>14-91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Cases where Suspended Declarations of Invalidity are Not Appropriate</td>
<td>14-94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Summary</td>
<td>14-98.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 15. REMEDIES AND ABORIGINAL RIGHTS .....

I. The Evolution and Purposes of Remedies for Violations of Aboriginal Rights

II. Interlocutory Remedies to Prevent Violations of Aboriginal Rights
   A. Strength of the Plaintiff’s Case
   B. Irreparable Harm to the Plaintiff and Defendant
      (1) Irreparable Harm to the Plaintiff
      (2) Irreparable Harm to the Defendant and Undertakings to Pay Damages
   C. No Presumption of Constitutionality or Preservation of the Status Quo
   D. The Balance of Convenience and the Public Interest
      (1) No Monopoly on the Public Interest
      (2) Determining the Balance of Convenience
      (3) The Duty to Consult
   E. Injunctions Against Aboriginal Protests
   F. Summary

III. Remedies for Breach of Constitutional Duties of Consultation
   A. Remedies for Breach of the Duty to Consult
   B. Quashing of Government Decisions to Allow Development
   C. Interlocutory Injunctions and Similar Remedies to Halt Proposed Developments that may Infringe Aboriginal Rights
   D. Declarations
   E. “Declarations Plus”
   F. Damages and Costs
   G. Jurisdictional Issues and the Duty to Consult

IV. Remedies for Pre-1982 Extinguishment or Diminution of Aboriginal Title
   A. Compensation for Expropriation
   B. No Legal Right to Compensation
   C. Remedies for Breach of Fiduciary Duty
   D. Criticisms of the Fiduciary Approach
   E. Declarations Concerning Government’s Discharge of Obligations
   F. Summary
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

V. Remedies for Violations of Section 35(1) of the Constitution Act, 1982

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Remedies in Litigation to Secure Aboriginal Rights</td>
<td>15-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Declarations</td>
<td>15-63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) “Declarations Plus” and Negotiation</td>
<td>15-64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Suspended Declarations of Invalidity and Transition Periods</td>
<td>15-72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Other Section 52(1) Remedies: Reading Down and Constitutional Exemptions</td>
<td>15-74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Injunctions and Other Equitable Remedies</td>
<td>15-75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(6) Compensation</td>
<td>15-76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(7) Summary</td>
<td>15-77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Remedies in Prosecutions Against Aboriginal Rights</td>
<td>15-78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

VI. Conclusion | 15-82

Index | IN-1