Electronic Evidence in Canada

Table of Contents

Volume 1

Preface ....................................................................................................................... v

Table of Contents ................................................................................................. vii

Table of Cases ....................................................................................................... TC-1

Part I — The Nature of ESI

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 The need to record information ................................................................. 1-2
1.2 ESI subject to rules of evidence ................................................................. 1-5
1.3 Relationship between ESI and other forms of evidence ... 1-8

Chapter 2 The Nature and Characteristics of Electronically Stored Information

2.1 Overview ......................................................................................................... 2-1
2.2 Nature of Electronically Stored Information ........................................... 2-1
2.3 Digital and analog ESI .................................................................................. 2-2
   (a) Digital ESI ................................................................................................. 2-2
   (b) Analog ESI ................................................................................................. 2-2
2.4 Permanently stored ESI .............................................................................. 2-3
2.5 Semi-permanent ESI ...................................................................................... 2-3
2.6 Transient ESI .................................................................................................. 2-4
2.7 Organization of ESI ....................................................................................... 2-4
   (a) Analog or digital ESI recorded to tape ............................................. 2-4
   (b) Transient ESI in computers ............................................................ 2-5
   (c) Digital ESI stored in files ................................................................. 2-5
   (d) Records ..................................................................................................... 2-6
   (e) Physical devices used to record ESI ................................................. 2-7
ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

2.8 Characteristics of ESI .............................................................2-9
(a) ESI is imperceptible in its native form ...............................2-9
(b) Digital ESI is easy to duplicate ......................................2-10
(c) ESI is easy to modify .....................................................2-11
(d) ESI is difficult to destroy ..............................................2-11
(e) ESI is pervasive .............................................................2-12
(f) Metadata .......................................................................2-12

2.9 Factors affecting admissibility of ESI.................................2-14

Part II — Pre-litigation Management of ESI

Chapter 3 Electronic Records
3.1 Electronic records generally..................................................3-2
3.2 Characteristics of an electronic record.................................3-4
(a) Authenticity ....................................................................3-4
(b) Reliability ........................................................................3-5
(c) Integrity ............................................................................3-5
(d) Usability ............................................................................3-6
3.3 Records management ............................................................3-6
(a) Reliability ........................................................................3-7
(b) Integrity ............................................................................3-7
(c) Compliance with legal and business requirements..................3-8
(d) Comprehensiveness .........................................................3-8
(e) Systematic nature ..............................................................3-8
3.4 Classification of records .......................................................3-8.1
(a) Transitory and permanent records .....................................3-8.1
(b) Administrative and operational records .............................3-9
3.5 Disposition of electronic records ...........................................3-10
(a) Destruction of electronic records ......................................3-11
Chapter 4  Obligation to Preserve ESI in Contemplation of Litigation

4.1 Scope of the obligation ...................................................... 4-1
4.2 Litigation holds ................................................................. 4-2
4.3 Failure to preserve .............................................................. 4-8

Part III — Managing ESI After a Proceeding Has Been Initiated

Chapter 5  The Obligation to Disclose ESI

5.1 What must be disclosed? .................................................. 5-2
5.2 Where electronic “documents” are found ....................... 5-4
5.3 The criminal context .......................................................... 5-5
   (a) Source of the obligation to make disclosure ............ 5-5
   (b) Scope of the obligation to disclose ......................... 5-7
   (c) Privacy interests ....................................................... 5-7
   (d) Consequences of a failure to disclose ..................... 5-8
5.4 In civil litigation ................................................................. 5-8
   (a) Sources of the obligation to disclose ESI .......... 5-8
   (b) Scope of the obligation to produce ESI ............. 5-8
      (i) Alberta ................................................................. 5-10
      (ii) Nova Scotia ......................................................... 5-11
      (iii) Ontario .............................................................. 5-12
      (iv) British Columbia .............................................. 5-14
      (v) Saskatchewan .................................................. 5-15
      (vi) Manitoba .......................................................... 5-16
      (vii) Other Canadian Jurisdictions ....................... 5-16
   (c) Devices as documents ............................................. 5-17
   (d) Limiting the scope of production ....................... 5-23
(i) Proportionality ......................................................5-23
(ii) Factors to be considered .....................................5-30
   (A) Cost/benefit analysis ....................................5-30
   (B) Intrusive nature of production ...................5-32
   (e) Consequences of failure to disclose .......................5-39

5.5 Jurisdictional considerations ........................................5-40

Chapter 6 Managing the Production of ESI

6.1 Protocols prescribing the manner of production ..........6-2
   (a) Sedona Principles .................................................6-3
   (b) Ontario Guidelines .............................................6-5
   (c) B.C. and Alberta Practice Directions ....................6-6
   (d) Saskatchewan and Manitoba ..............................6-8
   (e) Ontario model precedents ..................................6-9

6.2 Process ........................................................................6-10
   (a) Ground rules..........................................................6-10.1
   (b) Advising the client ..............................................6-11
   (c) Communicating with opposing counsel ...............6-12
   (d) Capturing relevant ESI .......................................6-15
   (e) Software choice ...............................................6-17
   (f) Effective coding and standards ..........................6-18
   (g) Standards for coding .........................................6-19
   (h) Standards for imaging .......................................6-19
   (i) Identification and treatment of duplicate and
       parent documents ................................................6-20

6.3 Special considerations when government is a party ......6-21

6.4 Producing ESI in native or other prescribed formats.....6-22

6.5 Obligation to provide assistance or proprietary
       software ..................................................................6-26

6.6 Minimizing review ....................................................6-28
   (a) Discovery planning — Agreement on the scope of
       production ............................................................6-28
TABLE OF CONTENTS

(b) Rules of court.................................................................6-29
(c) Limiting review of your own documents ..........6-30.3

6.7 Requests for further production.................................6-30.6

6.8 Confidentiality concerns ..............................................6-31

6.9 Privilege...........................................................................6-31
   (a) Is ESI privileged? .........................................................6-32
   (b) Inadvertent waiver of privilege...............................6-32
   (c) Preserving privilege.....................................................6-35
   (d) Sanctions for improper dealings with privileged
documents ...........................................................................6-37

6.10 Costs.................................................................................6-43
       (a) Cost shifting.................................................................6-44
       (b) Taxable items ...............................................................6-48

Chapter 7 Managing the Production of ESI in Criminal Proceedings

7.1 Sufficiency of electronic disclosure ....................................7-2

7.2 Requirement to disclose electronically..............................7-4.3

7.3 Requirement to provide software......................................7-6

7.4 Lack of perfection ................................................................7-8

7.5 Special circumstances ......................................................7-9

Chapter 8 Spoliation

8.1 Elements of spoliation.........................................................8-1

8.2 Consequences of a finding of spoliation..............................8-8
       (a) Practice considerations ..............................................8-12

8.3 The emerging tort of spoliation........................................8-14

8.4 How to avoid a finding of spoliation .................................8-16

Chapter 9 Ensuring Preservation of ESI Held by Others

9.1 Anton Piller orders ............................................................9-2

9.2 Preservation orders............................................................9-6

9.3 Privilege issues.................................................................9-9
Chapter 10  Pre-trial Authentication of ESI

10.1 Authentication of ESI by agreement.................................10-1
(a) Nature of an agreement to admit the authenticity of ESI ...........................................10-2.1
(b) Effect of an agreement respecting ESI at trial ...........10-3

10.2 Gaining pre-trial admissions with respect to ESI ...........10-4
(a) What needs to be admitted...........................................10-5
(b) Permissible scope of pre-trial admissions ...............10-5
(c) Seeking admissions with respect to authenticity........................................10-6
(d) What admissions to seek with respect to ESI — and how to seek them ...............10-9
(e) Use of pre-trial admissions at trial .........................10-13

10.3 Using ESI at pre-trial examinations of parties ...........10-14
(a) Exploring the opponent’s case.................................10-14
(b) Gaining admissions on oral examinations ..........10-15
(c) Identifying ESI on pre-trial examinations ..........10-15
(d) Using ESI at trial ......................................................10-16

Part IV — Use and Presentation of ESI at Trial

Chapter 11  Admissibility of ESI Generally

11.1 Relevance and materiality .................................................11-3
11.2 Logical relevance and legal relevance .........................11-7
11.3 Authenticity and reliability of ESI as part of logical relevance ........................................11-10
(a) Preliminary assessment of authenticity and reliability ........................................11-11
(b) Meaning of “authenticity”........................................11-12
(c) Meaning of “reliability”............................................11-14
TABLE OF CONTENTS

(d) Authenticity and reliability contrasted ..........................11-15
(e) Proof of authenticity and reliability generally ..........11-16
(f) Voir dire to determine admissibility ......................... 11-18.1
(g) Authenticity and reliability influenced by life
cycle of ESI ..................................................................11-18
   (i) Creation of original ESI ..................................11-19
       (A) Authentication of original ESI ..................11-19
       (B) Reliability of original ESI ......................11-20
       (C) Provenance of original ESI .................11-21
   (ii) Obtaining a copy of the original ESI .............11-25
   (iii) Proof of continuity — chain of custody .......11-28
(h) Proof of authenticity .................................................11-32
   (i) Proof of authenticity is contextual .................11-33
   (ii) Proof of authenticity — standard of proof ....11-35
(i) Proof of reliability ...................................................11-35
   (i) Purpose dictates nature of evidence required
to establish reliability ........................................11-35
   (ii) Threshold reliability required and standard
of proof .......................................................................11-36
       (A) Threshold reliability of ESI from
automated systems ..........................................11-38
       (B) Threshold reliability of ESI from human
sources ............................................................11-40
11.4 Evidence not otherwise subject to an exclusionary
rule ...............................................................................11-41
   (a) Common law discretion to exclude evidence
when prejudicial effect outweighs probative
value ........................................................................11-41
       (i) History of the evolution of the discretion ....11-44
       (ii) Interaction with the Charter — the
constitutional imperative ...............................11-45
       (iii) Exclusion of evidence in civil matters ....11-47
   (b) Weighing probative value and prejudicial effect...11-49
ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

(i) Three-stage test .................................................. 11-51
(ii) Probative value .................................................. 11-52
(A) Value in relation to an issue ....................... 11-52
(B) Reliability of evidence affects its probative value ............................................ 11-54
(C) ‘Probative value’ in relation to demonstrative evidence ...................................... 11-54.1

(iii) Evaluating prejudicial effect ......................... 11-55
(iv) Meaning of “prejudice” ...................................... 11-57
(c) Balancing probative value against prejudicial effect ........................................ 11-59
(i) Balancing act ...................................................... 11-61
(ii) Can prejudice be offset by a direction to the jury? .............................................. 11-63

11.5 Best evidence rule ........................................... 11-64

Chapter 12 Admissibility of ESI as Real Evidence

12.1 Meaning of real evidence ...................................... 12-2

12.2 Classification of ESI as real evidence ....................... 12-2
(a) Distinguishing ESI that is real evidence from other forms of evidence .................... 12-4
(b) Non-hearsay nature of ESI from automated processes ........................................ 12-6.2

12.3 Proof of authenticity and threshold reliability of ESI when tendered as real evidence .... 12-10
(a) Proof of authenticity .................................... 12-10.1
(b) Authenticity of ESI in possession ................. 12-11
(c) Proof of authorship of electronic documents ........ 12-12
(d) Proof of threshold reliability ......................... 12-14

12.4 ESI tendered for other purposes ......................... 12-13

12.5 Specific types of ESI as real evidence ............... 12-16
(a) Metadata ...................................................... 12-16
(i) System metadata ........................................... 12-18
(ii) Substantive metadata ................................. 12-18.2
(iii) Embedded metadata................................. 12-19
(b) ESI on the Internet as real evidence .............. 12-20
(c) ESI in possession of an individual ................. 12-22
(d) Digital photographs .................................. 12-25
(e) Audiotapes ............................................. 12-26
   (i) Admissibility of audiotapes ....................... 12-26
   (ii) Authentication of audiotapes ...................... 12-27
   (iii) Complete recording of the transaction ....... 12-28
   (iv) Recording not misleading or confusing ....... 12-29
   (v) Quality of recording ............................... 12-29
   (vi) Probative value not overborne by prejudicial effect ........................................ 12-30
   (vii) Use of transcripts of audiotapes ............... 12-31
(f) Videotapes .......................................... 12-32
   (i) Admissibility of videotapes ....................... 12-34
   (ii) Authenticity of videotapes ....................... 12-35
   (iii) The quality of the video and audio reproduction ........................................ 12-38
   (iv) Presence or absence of inadmissible material, and the ability to eliminate objectionable material by editing 12-38.2
   (v) Displaying admissible videotape at trial ....... 12-39
   (vi) Discretion to exclude — prejudice to the fairness of the trial ................................ 12-39
   (vii) Videotape evidence under the Canada Evidence Act ........................................ 12-40
(g) Transient ESI ......................................... 12-40

Chapter 13  Admissibility of ESI as Documentary Evidence

13.1 Electronic documents generally .......................... 13-2
   (a) Treatment of electronic documents is similar to conventional documents .................. 13-7
13.2 Specific instances of electronic documents......................13-18

(a) Word processing documents.................................13-18
(b) Emails and instant messages............................... 13-18.2
(c) ESI from the Internet ............................................ 13-22.1
   (i) ESI from the Internet as documentary evidence .................. 13-22.2
   (ii) ESI from the Internet as real evidence ..........13-27
   (iii) Possession of ESI from Internet sources ......13-27
(d) Pdfs, engineering drawings.................................. 13-28.1
(e) Spreadsheets and summaries of information .... 13-28.1
   (i) Spreadsheets used to summarize evidence ........................................ 13-28.3
   (ii) Use of spreadsheets in court........................ 13-28.4

13.3 Electronic Records ................................................. 13-28.6

(a) Characteristics and classification of electronic records............................................13-29
(b) Business records ..............................................13-33
   (i) Documentary electronic records as business records..............................13-34
   (ii) Real electronic records as business records...........................................13-39
   (iii) Proper functioning of the computer used to store records.........................13-42
(c) Print-outs of electronically-stored records..............13-42

Chapter 14 Admissibility of ESI as Demonstrative Evidence

14.1 The meaning of “demonstrative evidence” ..............14-1
14.2 Admissibility of ESI as demonstrative evidence..........14-2
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

(a) Authenticity and threshold reliability of
demonstrative ESI......................................................14-3

(b) Assessing the utility of demonstrative ESI .............14-4
   (i) Reliability of demonstrative ESI.....................14-4
   (ii) Necessity of demonstrative ESI .....................14-5
   (iii) Cost of demonstrative ESI ............................14-6
   (iv) Determining the utility of demonstrative
        ESI..................................................................14-6

(c) Weighing the potential prejudice of demonstrative
    ESI........................................................................14-6

(d) Balancing utility and potential prejudice..............14-7

14.3 Classification of demonstrative ESI — factual
    matters and opinion evidence..................................14-9
   (a) Animations: computer-generated illustrations
       of factual matters..............................................14-11
   (b) Simulations: computer-generated ESI in support
       of opinion evidence .........................................14-11
   (c) Distinction between animations and
       simulations.........................................................14-12

14.4 Animations — demonstrative ESI illustrating
    factual matters......................................................14-16

14.5 Demonstrative ESI to illustrate opinions —
    simulations..........................................................14-19
   (a) Computer-generated simulations.....................14-19
   (b) Two approaches to the admissibility of
       simulations.........................................................14-20
   (c) Determining the reliability of simulations........14-22
      (i) Validity of the computer program ..............14-23
      (ii) Validity of the data.................................14-26
      (iii) Proper functioning of the program with
            the data supplied........................................14-26
      (iv) Output is a fair and valid representation.....14-27
   (d) Other aspects of admissibility of simulations......14-27
Chapter 15  Working with ESI at Trial

15.01 Communicating with the Court .................................................................15-2
   (a) Federal Courts ..................................................................................15-3
   (b) Alberta ..................................................................................................15-4.1
   (c) British Columbia ..................................................................................15-4.1
   (d) Newfoundland and Labrador ...........................................................15-4.2
   (e) Nova Scotia ..........................................................................................15-4.2
   (f) Ontario ..................................................................................................15-4.3
   (g) Prince Edward Island ............................................................................15-4.6
   (h) Saskatchewan .......................................................................................15-4.7
   (i) Nunavut .................................................................................................15-4.7
   (j) Other Provinces and Territories ............................................................15-4.7

15.1 Practice direction ....................................................................................15-4.8

15.2 Preparation for trial ..................................................................................15-4.10

15.3 Trial .........................................................................................................15-4.11
   (a) Preliminary considerations ..................................................................15-5
   (b) Preparation ..............................................................................................15-6
   (c) Equipment ..............................................................................................15-7
   (d) Software and database .........................................................................15-8
   (e) Technician ...............................................................................................15-8
   (f) Transcripts ...............................................................................................15-9
   (g) Digitized mapping ..................................................................................15-9
   (h) External communication .......................................................................15-10

15.4 The trial record .......................................................................................15-12

15.5 Written argument ....................................................................................15-12

15.6 Afterword ..................................................................................................15-12
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Volume 2**

*Table of Contents* ........................................................................................................... iii

**Appendices**

*Contents* ....................................................................................................................... App-i

- Appendix A  The Sedona Canada Principles: Addressing Electronic Discovery.................. APP-1
- Appendix B  Guidelines for the Discovery of Electronic Documents in Ontario .................. APP-57
- Appendix C  National Model Practice Direction for the Use of Technology in Civil Litigation........ APP-79
- Appendix D  National Generic Protocol for Use with the National Model Practice Direction for the Use of Technology in Civil Litigation........ APP-113
- Appendix E  The Sedona Canada Commentary on Proportionality in Electronic Disclosure & Discovery ........................................................................ APP-127
- Appendix F  Model E-Discovery and E-Trial Precedents.................................................. APP-177
- Appendix G  Toronto Region Commercial List e-Delivery Pilot Project - Guidelines for Preparing and Delivering Electronic Documents requested by Judges, June, 2012 APP-437

*Index* ............................................................................................................................. I-1