

# Electronic Evidence in Canada

## Table of Contents

### Volume 1

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>Table of Contents</i> .....	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	TC-1

### Part I — The Nature of ESI

#### Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 The need to record information.....	1-2
1.2 ESI subject to rules of evidence .....	1-5
1.3 Relationship between ESI and other forms of evidence ...	1-8

#### Chapter 2 The Nature and Characteristics of Electronically Stored Information

2.1 Overview.....	2-1
2.2 Nature of Electronically Stored Information .....	2-1
2.3 Digital and analog ESI .....	2-2
(a) Digital ESI .....	2-2
(b) Analog ESI .....	2-2
2.4 Permanently stored ESI.....	2-3
2.5 Semi-permanent ESI.....	2-3
2.6 Transient ESI.....	2-4
2.7 Organization of ESI.....	2-4
(a) Analog or digital ESI recorded to tape .....	2-4
(b) Transient ESI in computers .....	2-5
(c) Digital ESI stored in files .....	2-5
(d) Records.....	2-6
(e) Physical devices used to record ESI.....	2-7

ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

(f) Recording digital files and records in storage devices..... 2-8

2.8 Characteristics of ESI..... 2-9

(a) ESI is imperceptible in its native form ..... 2-9

(b) Digital ESI is easy to duplicate ..... 2-10

(c) ESI is easy to modify ..... 2-11

(d) ESI is difficult to destroy ..... 2-11

(e) ESI is pervasive ..... 2-12

(f) Metadata ..... 2-12

2.9 Factors affecting admissibility of ESI..... 2-14

**Part II — Pre-litigation Management of ESI**

**Chapter 3 Electronic Records**

3.1 Electronic records generally..... 3-2

3.2 Characteristics of an electronic record..... 3-4

(a) Authenticity ..... 3-4

(b) Reliability ..... 3-5

(c) Integrity..... 3-5

(d) Usability ..... 3-6

3.3 Records management ..... 3-6

(a) Reliability ..... 3-7

(b) Integrity..... 3-7

(c) Compliance with legal and business requirements..... 3-8

(d) Comprehensiveness ..... 3-8

(e) Systematic nature..... 3-8

3.4 Classification of records..... 3-8.1

(a) Transitory and permanent records..... 3-8.1

(b) Administrative and operational records ..... 3-9

3.5 Disposition of electronic records ..... 3-10

(a) Destruction of electronic records..... 3-11

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(b) Disposition of electronic records .....3-12

**Chapter 4 Obligation to Preserve ESI in Contemplation of Litigation**

4.1 Scope of the obligation ..... 4-1  
4.2 Litigation holds ..... 4-2.1  
4.3 Failure to preserve ..... 4-8

**Part III — Managing ESI After a Proceeding Has Been Initiated**

**Chapter 5 The Obligation to Disclose ESI**

5.1 What must be disclosed? ..... 5-2  
5.2 Where electronic “documents” are found ..... 5-4  
5.3 The criminal context ..... 5-5  
    (a) Source of the obligation to make disclosure ..... 5-5  
    (b) Scope of the obligation to disclose ..... 5-7  
    (c) Privacy interests ..... 5-7  
    (d) Consequences of a failure to disclose ..... 5-8  
5.4 In civil litigation ..... 5-8  
    (a) Sources of the obligation to disclose ESI ..... 5-8  
    (b) Scope of the obligation to produce ESI ..... 5-8.1  
        (i) Alberta ..... 5-10  
        (ii) Nova Scotia ..... 5-11  
        (iii) Ontario ..... 5-12  
        (iv) British Columbia ..... 5-14  
        (v) Saskatchewan ..... 5-15  
        (vi) Manitoba ..... 5-16  
        (vii) Other Canadian Jurisdictions ..... 5-16  
    (c) Devices as documents ..... 5-17  
    (d) Limiting the scope of production ..... 5-23

ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

(i) Proportionality .....5-23

(ii) Factors to be considered .....5-30

    (A) Cost/benefit analysis .....5-30

    (B) Intrusive nature of production .....5-32

(e) Consequences of failure to disclose .....5-39

5.5 Jurisdictional considerations .....5-40

**Chapter 6 Managing the Production of ESI**

6.1 Protocols prescribing the manner of production .....6-2

    (a) Sedona Principles .....6-3

    (b) Ontario Guidelines .....6-5

    (c) B.C. and Alberta Practice Directions .....6-6

    (d) Saskatchewan and Manitoba .....6-8

    (e) Ontario model precedents .....6-9

6.2 Process .....6-10

    (a) Ground rules .....6-10.1

    (b) Advising the client .....6-11

    (c) Communicating with opposing counsel .....6-12

    (d) Capturing relevant ESI .....6-15

    (e) Software choice .....6-17

    (f) Effective coding and standards .....6-18

    (g) Standards for coding .....6-19

    (h) Standards for imaging .....6-19

    (i) Identification and treatment of duplicate and  
        parent documents .....6-20

6.3 Special considerations when government is a party .....6-21

6.4 Producing ESI in native or other prescribed formats .....6-22

6.5 Obligation to provide assistance or proprietary  
software .....6-26

6.6 Minimizing review .....6-28

    (a) Discovery planning — Agreement on the scope of  
        production .....6-28

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

(b)	Rules of court.....	6-29
(c)	Limiting review of your own documents .....	6-30.3
6.7	Requests for further production.....	6-30.6
6.8	Confidentiality concerns .....	6-31
6.9	Privilege.....	6-31
(a)	Is ESI privileged? .....	6-32
(b)	Inadvertent waiver of privilege.....	6-32
(c)	Preserving privilege.....	6-35
(d)	Sanctions for improper dealings with privileged documents .....	6-37
6.10	Costs.....	6-43
(a)	Cost shifting.....	6-44
(b)	Taxable items .....	6-48
<b>Chapter 7 Managing the Production of ESI in Criminal Proceedings</b>		
7.1	Sufficiency of electronic disclosure .....	7-2
7.2	Requirement to disclose electronically.....	7-4.3
7.3	Requirement to provide software.....	7-6
7.4	Lack of perfection .....	7-8
7.5	Special circumstances .....	7-9
<b>Chapter 8 Spoliation</b>		
8.1	Elements of spoliation.....	8-1
8.2	Consequences of a finding of spoliation.....	8-8
(a)	Practice considerations .....	8-12
8.3	The emerging tort of spoliation.....	8-14
8.4	How to avoid a finding of spoliation .....	8-16
<b>Chapter 9 Ensuring Preservation of ESI Held by Others</b>		
9.1	Anton Piller orders .....	9-2
9.2	Preservation orders .....	9-6
9.3	Privilege issues.....	9-9

ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

9.4 Norwich Pharmacal orders .....9-10  
9.5 Discovery against non-parties .....9-17

**Chapter 10 Pre-trial Authentication of ESI**

10.1 Authentication of ESI by agreement.....10-1  
    (a) Nature of an agreement to admit the  
        authenticity of ESI .....10-2.1  
    (b) Effect of an agreement respecting ESI at trial ..... 10-3  
10.2 Gaining pre-trial admissions with respect to ESI ..... 10-4  
    (a) What needs to be admitted..... 10-5  
    (b) Permissible scope of pre-trial admissions ..... 10-5  
    (c) Seeking admissions with respect to  
        authenticity..... 10-6  
    (d) What admissions to seek with respect to ESI —  
        and how to seek them ..... 10-9  
    (e) Use of pre-trial admissions at trial ..... 10-13  
10.3 Using ESI at pre-trial examinations of parties.....10-14  
    (a) Exploring the opponent’s case ..... 10-14  
    (b) Gaining admissions on oral examinations ..... 10-15  
    (c) Identifying ESI on pre-trial examinations ..... 10-15  
    (d) Using ESI at trial ..... 10-16

**Part IV — Use and Presentation of ESI at Trial**

**Chapter 11 Admissibility of ESI Generally**

11.1 Relevance and materiality ..... 11-3  
11.2 Logical relevance and legal relevance..... 11-7  
11.3 Authenticity and reliability of ESI as part of logical  
    relevance..... 11-10  
    (a) Preliminary assessment of authenticity and  
        reliability ..... 11-11  
    (b) Meaning of “authenticity” ..... 11-12  
    (c) Meaning of “reliability” ..... 11-14

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- (d) Authenticity and reliability contrasted.....11-15
- (e) Proof of authenticity and reliability generally .....11-16
- (f) *Voir dire* to determine admissibility ..... 11-18.1
- (g) Authenticity and reliability influenced by life cycle of ESI .....11-18
  - (i) Creation of original ESI.....11-19
    - (A) Authentication of original ESI .....11-19
    - (B) Reliability of original ESI .....11-20
    - (C) Provenance of original ESI .....11-21
  - (ii) Obtaining a copy of the original ESI.....11-25
  - (iii) Proof of continuity — chain of custody .....11-28
- (h) Proof of authenticity.....11-32
  - (i) Proof of authenticity is contextual.....11-33
  - (ii) Proof of authenticity — standard of proof.....11-35
- (i) Proof of reliability .....11-35
  - (i) Purpose dictates nature of evidence required to establish reliability .....11-35
  - (ii) Threshold reliability required and standard of proof .....11-36
    - (A) Threshold reliability of ESI from automated systems .....11-38
    - (B) Threshold reliability of ESI from human sources .....11-40
- 11.4 Evidence not otherwise subject to an exclusionary rule .....11-41
  - (a) Common law discretion to exclude evidence when prejudicial effect outweighs probative value .....11-41
    - (i) History of the evolution of the discretion.....11-44
    - (ii) Interaction with the Charter — the constitutional imperative .....11-45
    - (iii) Exclusion of evidence in civil matters.....11-47
  - (b) Weighing probative value and prejudicial effect...11-49

ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

- (i) Three-stage test.....11-51
- (ii) Probative value .....11-52
  - (A) Value in relation to an issue .....11-52
  - (B) Reliability of evidence affects its probative value.....11-54
  - (C) 'Probative value' in relation to demonstrative evidence ..... 11-54.1
- (iii) Evaluating prejudicial effect.....11-55
- (iv) Meaning of “prejudice” .....11-57
- (c) Balancing probative value against prejudicial effect .....11-59
  - (i) Balancing act .....11-61
  - (ii) Can prejudice be offset by a direction to the jury?.....11-63
- 11.5 Best evidence rule.....11-64
- Chapter 12 Admissibility of ESI as Real Evidence**
- 12.1 Meaning of real evidence.....12-2
- 12.2 Classification of ESI as real evidence .....12-2
  - (a) Distinguishing ESI that is real evidence from other forms of evidence.....12-4
  - (b) Non-hearsay nature of ESI from automated processes.....12-6.2
- 12.3 Proof of authenticity and threshold reliability of ESI when tendered as real evidence .....12-10
  - (a) Proof of authenticity.....12-10.1
  - (b) Authenticity of ESI in possession .....12-11
  - (c) Proof of authorship of electronic documents.....12-12
  - (d) Proof of threshold reliability.....12-14
- 12.4 ESI tendered for other purposes.....12-13
- 12.5 Specific types of ESI as real evidence.....12-16
  - (a) Metadata .....12-16
    - (i) System metadata .....12-18

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

(ii)	Substantive metadata .....	12-18.2
(iii)	Embedded metadata.....	12-19
(b)	ESI on the Internet as real evidence .....	12-20
(c)	ESI in possession of an individual .....	12-22
(d)	Digital photographs.....	12-25
(e)	Audiotapes.....	12-26
(i)	Admissibility of audiotapes.....	12-26
(ii)	Authentication of audiotapes.....	12-27
(iii)	Complete recording of the transaction.....	12-28
(iv)	Recording not misleading or confusing.....	12-29
(v)	Quality of recording.....	12-29
(vi)	Probative value not overborne by prejudicial effect.....	12-30
(vii)	Use of transcripts of audiotapes .....	12-31
(f)	Videotapes.....	12-32
(i)	Admissibility of videotapes .....	12-34
(ii)	Authenticity of videotapes.....	12-35
(iii)	The quality of the video and audio reproduction.....	12-38
(iv)	Presence or absence of inadmissible material, and the ability to eliminate objectionable material by editing.....	12-38.2
(v)	Displaying admissible videotape at trial.....	12-39
(vi)	Discretion to exclude — prejudice to the fairness of the trial.....	12-39
(vii)	Videotape evidence under the <i>Canada     Evidence Act</i> .....	12-40
(g)	Transient ESI .....	12-40
<b>Chapter 13 Admissibility of ESI as Documentary Evidence</b>		
13.1	Electronic documents generally .....	13-2
(a)	Treatment of electronic documents is similar to conventional documents.....	13-7

ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

- (b) Authentication of ESI when offered as documentary evidence..... 13-7
- (c) Threshold reliability of electronic documents..... 13-14
- (d) Hearsay nature of electronic documents ..... 13-15
- (e) Purposes for tendering electronic documents ..... 13-16
- 13.2 Specific instances of electronic documents..... 13-18
  - (a) Word processing documents..... 13-18
  - (b) Emails and instant messages ..... 13-18.2
  - (c) ESI from the Internet ..... 13-22.1
    - (i) ESI from the Internet as documentary evidence ..... 13-22.2
    - (ii) ESI from the Internet as real evidence ..... 13-27
    - (iii) Possession of ESI from Internet sources ..... 13-27
  - (d) Pdfs, engineering drawings..... 13-28.1
  - (e) Spreadsheets and summaries of information .... 13-28.1
    - (i) Spreadsheets used to summarize evidence ..... 13-28.3
    - (ii) Use of spreadsheets in court..... 13-28.4
- 13.3 Electronic Records ..... 13-28.6
  - (a) Characteristics and classification of electronic records..... 13-29
  - (b) Business records ..... 13-33
    - (i) Documentary electronic records as business records ..... 13-34
    - (ii) Real electronic records as business records..... 13-39
    - (iii) Proper functioning of the computer used to store records..... 13-42
  - (c) Print-outs of electronically-stored records..... 13-42

**Chapter 14 Admissibility of ESI as Demonstrative Evidence**

- 14.1 The meaning of “demonstrative evidence” ..... 14-1
- 14.2 Admissibility of ESI as demonstrative evidence..... 14-2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- (a) Authenticity and threshold reliability of demonstrative ESI..... 14-3
- (b) Assessing the utility of demonstrative ESI ..... 14-4
  - (i) Reliability of demonstrative ESI..... 14-4
  - (ii) Necessity of demonstrative ESI ..... 14-5
  - (iii) Cost of demonstrative ESI ..... 14-6
  - (iv) Determining the utility of demonstrative ESI..... 14-6
- (c) Weighing the potential prejudice of demonstrative ESI..... 14-6
- (d) Balancing utility and potential prejudice..... 14-7
- 14.3 Classification of demonstrative ESI — factual matters and opinion evidence..... 14-9
  - (a) Animations: computer-generated illustrations of factual matters..... 14-11
  - (b) Simulations: computer-generated ESI in support of opinion evidence ..... 14-11
  - (c) Distinction between animations and simulations..... 14-12
- 14.4 Animations — demonstrative ESI illustrating factual matters ..... 14-16
- 14.5 Demonstrative ESI to illustrate opinions — simulations..... 14-19
  - (a) Computer-generated simulations..... 14-19
  - (b) Two approaches to the admissibility of simulations..... 14-20
  - (c) Determining the reliability of simulations..... 14-22
    - (i) Validity of the computer program ..... 14-23
    - (ii) Validity of the data..... 14-26
    - (iii) Proper functioning of the program with the data supplied ..... 14-26
    - (iv) Output is a fair and valid representation ..... 14-27
  - (d) Other aspects of admissibility of simulations..... 14-27

ELECTRONIC EVIDENCE IN CANADA

14.6 Re-enactments .....14-28  
14.7 Use of demonstrative aids at trial.....14-30  
14.8 Conclusion .....14-32

**Chapter 15 Working with ESI at Trial**

15.01 Communicating with the Court .....15-2  
    (a) Federal Courts.....15-3  
    (b) Alberta .....15-4.1  
    (c) British Columbia.....15-4.1  
    (d) Newfoundland and Labrador.....15-4.2  
    (e) Nova Scotia .....15-4.2  
    (f) Ontario.....15-4.3  
    (g) Prince Edward Island .....15-4.6  
    (h) Saskatchewan .....15-4.7  
    (i) Nunavut.....15-4.7  
    (j) Other Provinces and Territories .....15-4.7  
15.1 Practice direction .....15-4.8  
15.2 Preparation for trial .....15-4.10  
15.3 Trial.....15-4.11  
    (a) Preliminary considerations .....15-5  
    (b) Preparation .....15-6  
    (c) Equipment.....15-7  
    (d) Software and database.....15-8  
    (e) Technician .....15-8  
    (f) Transcripts .....15-9  
    (g) Digitized mapping.....15-9  
    (h) External communication.....15-10  
15.4 The trial record .....15-12  
15.5 Written argument.....15-12  
15.6 Afterword.....15-12

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Volume 2**

*Table of Contents* .....iii

**Appendices**

*Contents* .....App-i

Appendix A The Sedona Canada Principles: Addressing  
Electronic Discovery..... APP-1

Appendix B Guidelines for the Discovery of Electronic  
Documents in Ontario ..... APP-57

Appendix C National Model Practice Direction for the  
Use of Technology in Civil Litigation..... APP-79

Appendix D National Generic Protocol for Use with the  
National Model Practice Direction for the  
Use of Technology in Civil Litigation..... APP-113

Appendix E The Sedona Canada Commentary on  
Proportionality in Electronic Disclosure &  
Discovery ..... APP-127

Appendix F Model E-Discovery and E-Trial  
Precedents..... APP-177

Appendix G Toronto Region Commercial List  
e-Delivery Pilot Project - Guidelines for  
Preparing and Delivering Electronic  
Documents requested by Judges,  
June, 2012..... APP-437

*Index* .....I-1