

Table of Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	TC-1
Chapter 1 The Foundation of Judicial Review and the Uniqueness of Constitutional Litigation	1-1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1-1
1.2 THE FOUNDATION OF JUDICIAL REVIEW	1-2
(1) The Legitimacy Issue	1-3
(2) The Enforceability Issue	1-8
(3) Conclusion	1-12
1.3 THE DISTINCTIVE NATURE OF CONSTITUTIONAL LITIGATION	1-13
Chapter 2 The Scope of Constitutional Litigation: Government Action	2-1
2.1 STATE ACTION IN U.S. CONSTITUTIONAL LAW	2-2
(1) The Actor.....	2-4
(a) The Government Itself.....	2-4
(b) The Control Test	2-4
(c) Entwinement.....	2-7
(2) The Activity.....	2-9
(a) Government Approval	2-10
(b) Government Encouragement or Coercion	2-12
(c) Symbiotic Relationship	2-13
(d) Government Function.....	2-15
2.2 GOVERNMENT ACTION UNDER THE CANADIAN CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS	2-18
(1) The Actor.....	2-24
(a) Control Test	2-26
(b) Government Function.....	2-29
(2) The Activity.....	2-32
(a) Statutory Power Plus a Specific Government Program or Policy	2-33
(b) Government Approval	2-42.3
(c) Government Encouragement or Coercion	2-42.5
(d) Symbiotic Relationship	2-42.7
2.3 THE SPECIAL CASE OF THE COURTS	2-43

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.4	SUMMARY OF GOVERNMENT ACTION UNDER THE CHARTER	2-45
	(1) Consider the Impugned Actor.....	2-46
	(2) Consider the Impugned Activity	2-47
	(3) Summary Chart of Cases by Actor	2-48
2.5	EXTRATERRITORIAL APPLICATION OF THE CHARTER	2-83
2.6	DIVISION OF POWERS	2-90
2.7	ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES	2-91
Chapter 3	Parties	3-1
3.1	INTRODUCTION	3-1
3.2	PLAINTIFFS OR APPLICANTS	3-1
	(1) The Law of Standing.....	3-1
	(a) Division of Powers	3-2
	(b) Standing under the Charter.....	3-6
	(c) Standing in Aboriginal Rights Cases.....	3-19
	(2) Mootness.....	3-22
	(3) Plaintiffs in Aboriginal Rights Cases.....	3-24.1
3.3	DEFENDANTS OR RESPONDENTS IN CONSTITUTIONAL CASES	3-28
	(1) Declaration of Invalidity of Legislation.....	3-29
	(2) Claims in Damages Against the Crown.....	3-30
	(3) Claims Against the Federal Crown	3-32
	(4) Representative Capacity — Provincial Ministers	3-32.1
	(5) Representative Capacity — Federal Ministers	3-33
	(6) Judicial Review.....	3-37
	(7) Other Parties	3-38
3.4	INTERVENERS	3-39
	(1) Introduction	3-39
	(2) Academic Commentary on Intervention in Constitutional Cases	3-40
	(a) Assisting the Court	3-40
	(b) Legitimacy Critiques.....	3-42
	(3) Intervention Rules	3-44
	(a) Attorneys General	3-44
	(b) Intervention as Added Party v. “Friend of the Court”	3-45
	(4) Interventions at the Court of First Instance	3-46
	(a) Tests Applied to Interventions in Constitutional Cases	3-46.1
	(5) Intervention on Appeals	3-53
	(6) Conduct of Interventions	3-56

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 4	Choice of Forum	4-1
4.1	INTRODUCTION	4-1
4.2	SUPERIOR COURTS	4-3
4.3	THE FEDERAL COURT OF CANADA	4-6
4.4	ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNALS	4-12.3
	(1) Introduction	4-12.3
	(2) The Impact of the Constitution on the Exercise of an Administrative Tribunal’s Discretion.....	4-12.4
	(3) Jurisdiction Under Section 24 and the Establishment of the Exclusive Jurisdiction Model: <i>Weber</i>	4-13
	(4) The Choice Among Tribunals.....	4-18.3
	(5) Section 52 and the Focus on Authority to Decide Questions of Law.....	4-18.5
	(6) Conclusion on Administrative Tribunals	4-25
	(7) Summary Chart of Cases	4-27
4.5	OTHER STATUTORY COURTS	4-38
	(1) Statutory Courts in General.....	4-38
	(2) Provincial Offences Court	4-41
	(3) Provincial Criminal Trial Court	4-42
	(4) Preliminary Inquiry Judges	4-42
	(5) Ontario Divisional Court	4-43
	(6) Appellate Courts.....	4-44
	(7) Bail Hearing Judges.....	4-45
4.6	CONCLUSION	4-46
Chapter 5	Choice of Procedure	5-1
5.1	INTRODUCTION	5-1
5.2	ACTIONS	5-1
	(1) Motions to Strike	5-4
	(2) Motions to Determine a Question of Law.....	5-5
	(3) Motions for Summary Judgment	5-7
	(a) Ontario.....	5-8
	(b) Other Provinces/Territories	5-10
	(c) Federal Court	5-14
	(d) Concluding Comments on Summary Judgment Motions.....	5-15
5.3	APPLICATIONS	5-15
	(1) Ontario.....	5-16
	(2) Other Jurisdictions.....	5-18
5.4	CLASS PROCEEDINGS	5-18.1
	(1) Constitutional Class Actions in the U.S.....	5-19
	(2) Canada’s Experience to Date	5-22

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(a) “Representative Actions” Before Class Actions	
	Legislation.....	5-22
	(b) <i>Guimond v. Quebec (A.G.)</i>	5-24
	(c) Cases Applying <i>Guimond</i> to Deny Certification.....	5-26
	(d) Cases Distinguishing <i>Guimond</i> and Granting	
	Certification.....	5-27
	(e) Constitutional Class Actions and <i>Res judicata</i>	5-31
	(f) Class Actions Combining Constitutional and	
	Other Causes of Action	5-32
	(g) Aboriginal Class Actions	5-33
	(h) Outlook for Class Actions in Constitutional	
	Litigation.....	5-34.1
5.5	TRIBUNAL PROCEEDINGS	5-34.2
5.6	JUDICIAL REVIEW OR STATUTORY APPEALS	
	FROM TRIBUNALS	5-37
	(1) From Evidentiary Hearings.....	5-38
	(2) From Other Government Decisions	5-40
5.7	REFERENCES	5-43
	(1) Scope of the Reference Power.....	5-43
	(2) The Court’s Discretion to Refuse to Decide.....	5-47
Chapter 6	Remedies	6-1
6.1	GENERAL PRINCIPLES	6-1
	(1) Introduction	6-1
	(2) Availability of Concurrent Remedies Under Sections 52	
	and 24	6-4
	(3) Retroactivity of Charter Remedies.....	6-8.2
6.2	SECTION 52(1) OF THE CONSTITUTION ACT, 1982,	
	DECLARATORY RELIEF, READING IN AND	
	READING OUT (SEVERANCE)	6-9
	(1) Introduction	6-9
	(2) Declaratory Relief	6-10
	(3) Reading Down	6-12.3
	(4) Severance (Reading Out) and Reading In	6-13
	(5) Constitutional Exemptions.....	6-21
6.3	SECTION 24(1) OF THE CHARTER	6-24
	(1) Introduction	6-24
	(2) Damages.....	6-26.3
	(3) Injunctions	6-26.11
	(a) General Rules.....	6-26.11
	(b) Structural Injunctions	6-28.1
6.4	SUSPENSION OF REMEDIES	6-36
6.5	SECTION 24(2) OF THE CHARTER	6-41

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(1)	Introduction: <i>Collins, Stillman</i> and the Law Before <i>Grant</i>	6-41
		(a) Trial Fairness	6-43
		(b) Seriousness of the Breach.....	6-45
		(c) Effect of the Exclusion on the Administration of Justice	6-48
	(2)	The <i>Grant</i> Criteria: A Refocusing on the Section 24(2) Analysis.....	6-49
		(a) Seriousness of the Charter-infringing State Conduct.....	6-50
		(b) Impact on the Charter — protected interests of the Accused	6-51
		(c) Society’s Interest in Adjudication on the Merits....	6-51
		(d) Application to Different Kinds of Evidence	6-51
		(e) Specific Application of the <i>Grant</i> Criteria	6-52.1
6.6		INTERIM REMEDIES	6-53
	(1)	Introduction	6-53
	(2)	Serious Constitutional Issue	6-54.2
	(3)	Irreparable Harm.....	6-54.4
		(a) Generally.....	6-54.4
		(b) Elections Cases	6-54.6
		(c) Social Welfare	6-55
		(d) Availability of Damages and other Remedies after Trial	6-56
	(4)	Balance of (In)Convenience	6-57
		(a) Solicitor-Client Privilege Cases.....	6-57
		(b) Elections Cases	6-57
		(c) Other Cases	6-59
	(5)	Public Interest	6-60
	(6)	Suspension and Exemption	6-62
6.7		COSTS	6-63
	(1)	Costs in Civil Constitutional Cases	6-63
	(2)	Costs in Criminal Constitutional Cases	6-66
	(3)	Costs for Intervenors	6-66.1
	(4)	Advance Interim Costs	6-66.2
6.8		REMEDIES IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES	6-67
	(1)	The Purposes of Aboriginal Rights Remedies — Academic Perspectives	6-67
	(2)	Cases Ordering Specific Remedies.....	6-70
		(a) Declarations	6-71
		(b) Constitutional Exemptions.....	6-72
		(c) Interlocutory Injunctions	6-73
		(d) “Structural” Injunctions.....	6-74

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(e) Compensatory Remedies.....	6-75
Chapter 7	Commencing the Proceeding	7-1
7.1	INTRODUCTION	7-1
7.2	SPECIFIC RULES APPLYING TO CROWN OR GOVERNMENT.....	7-1
	(1) Notice of Claim Provisions	7-1
	(2) Crown Immunity Provisions	7-3
	(3) Short Limitation Periods Applying to Governments.....	7-7
7.3	PLEADING A CONSTITUTIONAL CASE.....	7-10
	(1) Drafting of Statement of Claim or Other Originating Document.....	7-12
	(2) A Case Study — <i>Lavigne v. O.P.S.E.U.</i>	7-14
	(3) Drafting of Defences/Responses.....	7-17
	(4) Amending the Pleadings.....	7-18
Chapter 8	Evidence in Constitutional Cases	8-1
8.1	DIVISION OF POWERS AND CHARTER LITIGATION ...	8-1
	(1) The Need for a Factual Record	8-1
	(a) Introduction	8-1
	(b) Historical Evolution of Admissibility of Extrinsic Evidence	8-2
	(c) Inherently Unreliable or Improper Material.....	8-5
	(d) Extrinsic Evidence in Charter Cases.....	8-6
	(e) The Need for a Proper Factual Record.....	8-7
	(f) Current Approach to Extrinsic Evidence in Division of Powers Cases.....	8-10
	(g) Some Factors to Consider on Adequacy of Factual Record.....	8-11
	(h) Nature and Sufficiency of Evidence in Constitutional Cases	8-15
	(2) Legislative Facts Versus Adjudicative Facts	8-18
	(3) Expert Evidence.....	8-18.4
	(a) A Properly Qualified Expert	8-18.8
	(b) Improper Legal Argument	8-18.11
	(c) Experts Exhibiting Lack of Independence	8-20
	(d) Straying Beyond Expertise	8-21
	(e) Procedure on Challenges to Affidavits	8-22
	(f) Effective Expert Affidavits or Reports	8-23
	(g) Cross-examination of Experts	8-25
	(h) Weighing of Experts	8-26
	(i) Deference to Findings of Legislative Fact	8-26.3
	(4) Brandeis Briefs and Judicial Notice.....	8-26.4

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(a) Pre-Charter Division of Powers Cases.....	8-26.5
	(b) Early Charter Cases.....	8-27
	(c) The Current Approach	8-28
8.2	UNIQUE ISSUES IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS	
	LITIGATION.....	8-33
	(1) The <i>Sui Generis</i> Nature of Aboriginal Rights Litigation.....	8-33
	(2) The Need for a Factual Record	8-35
	(3) Oral History Evidence	8-37
	(4) Historical Documents	8-40
	(5) Expert Evidence.....	8-42.1
	(6) Expert Historians.....	8-43
	(7) Emerging Disciplines	8-44
	(8) Improper Legal Argument	8-44
	(9) Experts Exhibiting Lack of Independence	8-45
	(10) Straying Beyond Expertise	8-46
	(11) Learned Treatises.....	8-46
	(12) Judicial Notice.....	8-47
Chapter 9	Discovery of Governments.....	9-1
9.1	INTRODUCTION	9-1
9.2	THE STATUTORY SCHEME.....	9-2
	(1) Provincial Governments.....	9-2
	(2) Federal Government.....	9-3
	(a) Procedural Rules	9-3
	(b) Privileges or Immunities under the <i>CEA</i>	9-4
9.3	SCOPE OF DISCOVERY IN CONSTITUTIONAL CASES.....	9-4
9.4	CHOICE OF REPRESENTATIVE TO BE QUESTIONED	9-6
	(1) Provincial Governments.....	9-7
	(2) Federal Government.....	9-9
9.5	CABINET CONFIDENCES.....	9-10
	(1) Provincial Governments.....	9-11
	(a) The Balance of Interests	9-12
	(b) Factors Applied in Balancing the Interests.....	9-14.1
	(c) Limitations on Orders for Discovery.....	9-19
	(d) Onus on the Parties and Deference	9-20
	(e) What Cabinet Documents Should be Protected? ...	9-20
	(2) Federal Government.....	9-21
	(a) Constitutionality of s. 39 of <i>CEA</i>	9-23
	(b) The Limited Scope of Review under s. 39	9-24
	(c) What is a Cabinet Document under s. 39?	9-24

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(d) Drawing an Adverse Inference	9-26
	(e) Procedure For Claiming Immunity Under s. 39	9-27
9.6	INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS, NATIONAL DEFENCE AND NATIONAL SECURITY	9-27
	(1) Introduction	9-27
	(2) Section 38 of <i>CEA</i>	9-28
	(a) Procedure on Claims Under s. 38 of <i>CEA</i>	9-28
	(b) Factors to be Considered on s. 38 Claims	9-31
	(c) International Relations	9-32.4
	(d) National Defence and Security	9-32.4
	(3) <i>Security of Information Act</i>	9-32.6
9.7	OTHER CASES OF PUBLIC INTEREST IMMUNITY	9-33
9.8	ACCESS TO INFORMATION LEGISLATION	9-36
9.9	DISCLOSURE IN CRIMINAL CASES	9-38
9.10	ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL PROCEEDINGS	9-41
9.11	UNIQUE DISCOVERY ISSUES IN ABORIGINAL RIGHTS CASES	9-41
	(1) Scope of Discovery	9-42
	(a) Obligation to Answer Questions of Historical Fact	9-42
	(b) Duty to Make Reasonable Inquiry	9-43
	(c) Ongoing Obligation to Produce Documents	9-44
	(d) The Crown's Duty to Produce Archival Documents	9-44
	(e) Questions of Mixed Fact and Law	9-45
	(2) Crown Privileges and Immunities	9-46
	(a) Public Interest Immunity	9-46
	(b) Solicitor-Client Privilege	9-46
Chapter 10	The Hearing	10-1
10.1	INTRODUCTION	10-1
10.2	NOTICE REQUIREMENTS	10-1
	(1) Notice of Constitutional Question	10-1
	(a) Introduction	10-1
	(b) Statutory Provisions	10-5
	(c) Case Law	10-9
	(2) Notice of Application to Exclude Evidence	10-14
10.3	BIFURCATED HEARINGS	10-15
	(1) General Approach	10-15
	(2) Bifurcation in Specific Contexts	10-17
	(a) Criminal Cases	10-17
	(b) Civil Cases	10-19
	(c) Statutory Bifurcation	10-21

TABLE OF CONTENTS

10.4	APPEALS	10-22
	(1) Introduction	10-22
	(2) Notice Requirements	10-22
	(3) Appeal Route	10-23
	(4) Raising New Issues on Appeal.....	10-24
	(5) Supplementing the Record	10-26
	(6) Standard of Review	10-27
	(7) Remedial Issues on Appeal	10-30
	Appendix — Selected Precedents	A-1
	Selected Legal Literature	SLL-1
	Index	I-1